Assessing Integration Measures for Vulnerable Migrant Groups (ASSESS)

November 2013 – May 2015

Policy Conference
Brussels, 28 May 2015
Mila Mancheva, Center for the Study of Democracy

www.assess-migrantintegration.eu

Co-funded by the European Union
Aims of the Assessment

- To contribute to EU level initiatives for monitoring the integration of third country nationals (TCN);
  - to address the heterogeneity of TCN groups
  - to identify levels of vulnerability among (potentially) vulnerable TCN across the EU

- To formulate recommendations for the enhancement of the integration of vulnerable migrant groups
- To raise awareness among national stakeholders

Co-funded by the European Union
Steps of the Assessment

- Review of EU and national level mechanisms for monitoring the integration of TCN;

- Adjustment and development of methods for monitoring of the integration of vulnerable TCN;

- Review and assessment of the integration of vulnerable TCN (policy and outcomes).

Ten EU Member States: Austria, Belgium, Bulgaria, Greece, Hungary, Italy, Malta, Poland, Slovakia, Spain
ASSESSING THE INTEGRATION OF VULNERABLE MIGRANT GROUPS (TCN)

A REVIEW OF FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS
Methodology of the Assessment

Three vulnerable migrant groups (TCN):
✓ TCN women;
✓ TCN children;
✓ TCN victims of trafficking (VoT).

Two levels of analysis
✓ Assessment of integration policies
✓ Assessment of integration outcomes
# Spheres of Assessment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TCN women</th>
<th>TCN children</th>
<th>TCN VoT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employment</td>
<td>Education</td>
<td>The right to stay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>Social Inclusion</td>
<td>Access to welfare and assistance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Inclusion</td>
<td>Guardianship</td>
<td>Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Active Citizenship</td>
<td></td>
<td>Employment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anti-discrimination</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Ten EU MS: TCN Profiles

Total TCN population/ TCN women/ TCN children:

Share of 4% to 7% of the general population
4% to 7% of the general (female) population
4% to 7.8% of the general (child) population
(Austria, Belgium, Greece, Italy, Spain)

*  

0.10% to 2.3% of the general population
0.3 % to 1.93 % of the general (female) popl.
0.07% to 1.72% of the general (child) popl.
(Bulgaria, Hungary, Malta, Poland, Slovakia)
TCN Women: Integration Outcomes

Employment – TCN women vs. native women

Negative gap in:
employment; self-employment; unemployment

Better performance in:
activity rate (EL, ES, IT, MT, PL); employment (MT);
TCN women vs. TCN men

Negative gap in:
employment; self-employment; activity rate, unemployment (EL, ES, IT)

Better performance in:
unemployment (BE, ES)
TCN Women: Integration Outcomes

Education – TCN women vs. native women

More unfavorable profiles
higher shares (more than 50%) at primary level (AT, BE, ES, IT)
lower shares at secondary and tertiary level (AT, BE, HU, IT, PL)

More favorable profiles
Lower shares at primary level (MT)
Higher shares at secondary level (El, ES)
Higher shares at tertiary level (MT, PL)
TCN Women: Integration Outcomes

Education – TCN women vs. TCN men

More favorable profiles

- smaller shares at primary level (except AT)
- equal, or higher shares at secondary level (except AT)
- higher shares at tertiary level
- higher shares of those engaged in life-long learning
TCN Women: Integration Outcomes

Social Inclusion – TCN women vs. native women

**Negative gap in:**
income generation; at risk of poverty and social exclusion; in-work at risk of poverty

TCN women vs. TCN men

**Negative gap in:**
income generation (AT, IT); at risk of poverty (AT); in-work at risk of poverty (BE, IT)

**Better performance in:**
Income generation (BE, ES, MT); at risk of poverty (BE, EL, MT); in-work at risk of poverty (AT, EL, ES, MT)
**TCN Women: Integration Policies**

- Main determinant: status rather than gender & vulnerability;

- Absence of integration policies targeting TCN women as a separate (vulnerable) category;
  - no/few gender specific policies for TCN integration
  - integration of TCN women is channelled through programs for the general population
  - few targeted programs for labor orientation (**AT**, **ES**, **HU**, **IT**)
  - few targeted programs for vocational training (**ES**, **IT**)
  - more vocational training programs for both TCN genders (**AT**, **BE**, **BG**, **EL**, **ES**, **HU**, **IT**, **PL**, **SK**)
  - no language courses designed for TCN women
TCN Women: Integration Policies

More developed integration policies for TCN (men and women) in EU MS with larger TCN communities

- language training
- provision of information (in TCNs own language)
- vocational training

- Decentralised approaches to TCN integration may lead to both more advanced or more restrictive implementation of integration
TCN Women: Integration Policies

- Restrictive policies for national level political participation of TCN in all MS;
- Policy approaches for local level political participation of TCN are in development:
  - rights to vote in municipal elections (BE, ES, HU, SK)
  - alternative initiatives for facilitation of TCN participation in local level governance (AT, BE, EL, IT)
- Opened policies for community life participation of TCN (civil society organisations, action groups, trade unions)
TCN Women: Recommendations

- EU MS should use gender perspective in developing programs for labor market integration of TCN women.
- Programs for language training.
- Programs for provision and dissemination of information.

- EU MS should consider providing job orientation programs in the TCNs national languages.

- More comprehensive and systematic integration programs for TCN women should be developed in BG, EL, HU, MT, PL, SK.
TCN Women: Recommendations

- Policies need to be developed to encourage more active participation of TCN women in local elections (BE, ES, HU, SK)

- TCN (women and men) should be given rights for local level political participation of TCN (AT, BG, EL, IT, MT, PL)

- Policies need to be developed to facilitate the participation of TCN women in consultative bodies at central and local levels (BG, HU, MT, PL, SK)
Monitoring Integration of TCN Women: Recommendations

- Need for the development of *quantitative comparative studies* to compensate for the lack of reliable statistical samples in MS with smaller TCN communities;
- Development of integration policies (at EU and national level) should be guided by *needs assessments* of the integration of TCN women;
- Need for *regular monitoring of the local level political participation* of TCN women (BE, ES, HU, SK);
- Need of *systematic monitoring of TCN membership in political parties, trade unions and civil society organisations*;
- Need for *in-depth assessments of the alternative practices* for facilitating the participation of TCN in local governance need to be designed and conducted (Austria, Belgium, Greece and Italy).
TCN Children: Integration Outcomes

Enrollment in Education:
Lower for TCN than for native children
- Insignificant differences in AT and BE
- Significant differences in BG, HU and SK

Enrollment in early child care and pre-school education
- Lower for TCN children than native children (AT, BE, BG, ES, HU, SK)
- Higher for TCN children than native children (EL)
TCN Children: Integration Outcomes

Early leavers from education and training:
Several times higher for TCN than for native children (AT, BE, EL, IT, ES)
Lower for TCN girls than TCN boys (AT, BE, EL, ES, IT)

Proportion of lowest performers in mathematics
➢ Higher for immigrant than non-immigrant students (AT, BE, EL, ES, IT)
TCN Children: Integration Policies

Education:

- Absence of policies for overcoming the gender differences in TCN educational participation
- Educational participation of TCN children is hampered by:
  - early and irreversible direction to general or vocational education
  - absence of targeted support in school for TCN children
  - insufficient assistance in learning the language of the host country
TCN Children: Integration Policies

Education:

- Positive examples of policies aiming at overcoming an unequal education start for TCN children:
  - intercultural schools (EL);
  - induction or reception classes for language training of newcomer TCN children (BE, MT);
  - assistant teachers (MT, PL);
  - usage of dedicated time within regular classes to enhance language skills of TCN children (IT);
  - considering the actual age as (one of the) main factor in class level placement (AT, HU, IT, PL).
TCN Children: Integration Policies

Social Inclusion:

- Non-contributory child-related support is not accessible for some or none TCN families (AT, BE, BG, HU, IT, MT, PL, SK)
- Child-related support schemes are often accessible to TCN families based on living minimums:
  - the more vulnerable TCN families have fewer opportunities to receive support
- Policies against poverty do not target vulnerable TCN children (AT, HU, PL, SK)
Monitoring the Integration of TCN Children

- Monitoring of integration policies for TCN children at national level is rather the exception
- No mechanisms for monitoring of the educational performance of TCN children exist at national and EU level
- The standard statistical indicators are not available for the age group 0-17
Monitoring the Integration of TCN Children: Recommendations

- EU MS should develop mechanisms for monitoring of integration policies for TCN children;
- Mechanisms for monitoring of the educational performance of TCN children should be developed at EU level;
- Data along the standard statistical indicators needs to be easily accessible for the age group 0-17