WHERE WE ARE ON ITTP AND WHY WE DO NEED MORE

Ernesto U. Savona (Director and Professor)
Transcrime-Università Cattolica, Milan

ernesto.savona@unicatt.it;

www.transcrime.it
After years of discussion of the Illicit Markets on Tobacco Products, things do not move beyond the schizophrenic directions of regulators and law enforcement: Regulators maximize health creating opportunities for crime and Law Enforcement combats this crime.
Opportunities change while law enforcement is stable

From one side, opportunities change actors, *modi operandi*, routes.
From the other, law enforcement believes this is a marginal traffic that costs 11 billion per year to Europe...quite relevant indeed!
What do we need?

Regulators understanding that prohibitionism does not pay and that reduction of damage from tobacco products could find healthier alternatives minimizing health and criminal costs.

Researchers moving toward innovative methods that could help to investigate the change of opportunities. Project Nexus of Transcrime funded by PMI Impact goes in this direction.
Overview of Nexus project

Project’s goals:

• **Estimating the illicit cigarette flows** through 30 European countries and 27 EEMA countries involved in the production, transit and consumption of illicit cigarettes;

• **Analysing the connections (NEXUS) of the flows** with the social, political and legislative framework;

• **Identifying operational and policy instruments to** tackle the illicit flows.
Key Achievements

The research exploits **Quantitative** and **Qualitative** information to:

1) **estimate the flows**.

- Reconstruction of the illicit cigarette trade across the 57 countries ➔ tracking every step of inflows and outflows.

2) **identify the contextual factors** influencing the illicit trade.

- Examining the **features** and **determinants** of the ITTP ➔ e.g. taxation, price differences, penalties, social acceptance, political instability, etc.
The Innovative Aspects of NEXUS Project

- NEXUS accounts for the transnational dimension of cigarette trafficking by considering the 28 (+2) EU countries together with other 27 countries involved in the production, transit and consumption of illicit cigarettes

- NEXUS identifies the facilitators of cigarette trafficking and quantifies their impact

- NEXUS relies on an innovative methodology to estimate illicit flows of cigarettes and the impact of facilitators
The Transnational Dimension of Cigarette Trafficking

- Cigarette trafficking is a **global transnational crime** encompassing different criminal actors and different **modi operandi**
- Cigarette trafficking to and through Europe, North Africa, Middle East and Central Asia involves **157 countries** that form **884 different connections**
- Despite the presence of multiple intersecting paths, cigarette trafficking through Europe clusters along **3 main routes**:
  - The North-Eastern Route
  - The Extended Balkan Route
  - The Maghreb Route
Cigarette Trafficking: Some Figures

132 billion illicit cigarettes consumed in 57 countries. 10% of total consumption is illicit.

Illicit cigarettes consumed in the EU:
- More than 20% come from Eastern European countries.
- Almost 40% come from the Middle East and North Africa.

Source: ITTP NEXUS In Europe And Beyond

transcrime

Universita Cattolica del Sacro Cuore
Facilitators of Cigarette Trafficking

- The identified facilitators constitute potential risk factors for illicit markets in general
- Facilitators are multiple and interconnected

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>North-Eastern Route</th>
<th>Extended Balkan Route</th>
<th>Maghreb Route</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Illicit whites manufacturers</td>
<td>Presence of transnational OCGs</td>
<td>Political instability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Price differentials with EU markets</td>
<td>Strategic geographical position</td>
<td>Social acceptance of trafficking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corruption</td>
<td>Economic hardship</td>
<td>Ineffective border control</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Other Key Facilitators

6.3€
Price of 1 pack of the most sold cigarettes in GERMANY

How many packs can you buy for the same price in other countries?

1% increase in corruption levels

28% increase in illicit inflows of cigarettes

CONNECTIONS
Source: ITTP NEXUS in Europe And Beyond

Armed conflicts or political crises
Presence of FTZs
Social tolerance
Corruption

Ukraine
Belarus
Czech Republic
Lithuania
Poland

Cigarette trafficking

Criminals exploit instability to avoid detection
Finance paramilitary operations

Armed conflicts
Innovative methodology 1/2

• The **innovative methodology** to estimate illicit flows of cigarettes and the impact of facilitators is an **added value** of the project.

• The innovative dimension lies in the **identification of each step** (all the countries through which cigarettes are trafficked) **of the path followed by illicit cigarettes** flowing from the origin (where cigarettes are produced) to the destination country (where cigarettes are finally consumed).

• On the contrary, **previous studies** were characterized by:
  1. **Limited attention to the trafficking flows** / No intermediate steps
  2. **Static indicators of illicit consumption** referring to single markets.
• Our estimate of the flows relies on an algorithm that searches for the most likely ("cheapest") paths from origin to destination in the cigarette trafficking network.

The algorithm exploits data on:
→ Illicit cigarette consumption (from Empty Pack Surveys)
→ Seizure cases (from Open Source Analyses)
→ Geographic distances

This allows to quantify illicit flows of cigarettes between any pair of countries.

In turn, the estimates of the flows allow for the statistical identification and analyses of the facilitators of cigarette trafficking.
An Exemplificative Result: the North-Eastern Route

Each step of the illicit flow has been mapped
Policy Implications

Presenting policies to tackle cigarette trafficking

POLICY IMPLICATIONS

Source: ITTP NEXUS in Europe And Beyond

- **Institutional policies**
  - Strengthen institutional capabilities

- **Socio-economic policies**
  - Implement stronger control in FTZs
  - Reduce unemployment

- **Regulatory policies**
  - Increase taxes gradually
  - Harmonise legislation

- **Culture-related policies**
  - Launch public awareness campaigns
  - Invest in advanced scanning technologies
  - Implement anti-corruption policies
  - Implement anti-money laundering policies

- **Crime reduction policies**
  - Reduce tax asymmetries