

# FINANCING OF TRAFFICKING IN HUMAN BEINGS IN GERMANY

Matenia Sirseldudi

In Germany, first forms of “girls trade” emerged around 1840, mainly trafficking children in order to introduce them into prostitution. This crime was mainly practiced by single persons and quickly forbidden by the authorities (Hofmann, 2002). In Bremen, the so called “Bremer Reglement” of 1852 set the rule that prostitution was not to be treated as a “real business.” Following this differentiation, it became possible to legally define prostitution as an immoral business delimited from legal business (Schmitter, 2013). In 1876, the first broader regulation of prostitution became effective and brothels were only allowed in special districts, while the women were barracked in brothels, stripped of their rights and easily exploited by the licensed establishments. This rather liberal approach changed towards a more repressive handling during the Second World War when pimps and prostitutes were preventively arrested and placed in concentration camps in order to maintain public order. At the same time, state-owned brothels were opened in order to keep morale high in the army and the broader working population (Hofmann, 2002). From 1940 to 1942, around 35,000 persons were forced into prostitution (Hofmann, 2002). In the 1950s, the state-owned brothels for forced prostitution were closed and it took until 1960s to legally open off-limits areas where prostitution was tolerated. While poverty, lack of perspective and bad housing conditions facilitated prostitution, human trafficking played no significant role any more, as the special post-war situation had created a disproportionate relation between men and women, German women were rather sold abroad, than foreign women trafficked into Germany.

When talking about forced prostitution, we see that human traffickers exploit legal as well as illegal migration flows in order to recruit women under false pretence (e.g. related to the high demand of job opportunities) and then force them into prostitution. The incentives for the perpetrators are high profit margins coming along with a comparatively low risk of detection and conviction. Still, forced prostitution is not a legal term, as in public discussion there are also arguments for prostitution being per se a consequence of male power structures exerting force upon women (Gerheim, 2012).

Organised human trafficking – although it was present before that time – expanded in Europe after the collapse of the communist bloc and strengthened during the Yugoslav wars of the 1990s and the following the Schengen Agreement and the establishment of the European Single Market in 1993 (Aghatise, 2004; Galiana, 2000). Since then, mostly young women from eastern Europe are being lured by organized gangs to western Europe promising them profitable work as waitresses or *au pairs*. After their arrival their papers are taken away, so they cannot move freely in the foreign country.

The legalisation of prostitution in Germany since 2002, without rigid controls in the location where potential victims of human trafficking prostitute themselves, made Germany an “Eldorado for pimps and brothel managers” (Cho, et al., 2013), a situation, however, that might change in near future with the implementation of the 2017 Protection of Prostitution Act (Prostituiererschutzgesetz, ProstSchG)<sup>1</sup> and its inherent regulations.

During the last few years, the number of investigations in the field of human trafficking remained constant. While the proceedings on labour exploitation declined a bit, the police had to cope with a high number of unreported cases in both sexual and labour exploitation.

Generally, prostitution and human trafficking are not easy to define, as they undergo constant changes as social phenomena. All experts interviewed for this report implicitly or, often enough, explicitly referred to the UN Convention against Transnational Organised Crime of 2000 and the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children. Although this protocol does not have a status of binding international law, it still has an important impact as a transnational cooperation agreement, where for the first time human trafficking is defined in detail. In it, the crime is defined as recruitment, transport, accommodation and reception of persons including the threat or exertion of violence or other forms of coercion, kidnapping, fraud, deceit, abuse of power or taking advantage of helpless people or receiving of payments or other benefits in order to obtain an agreement with a person coercing power over another person. Additionally, the perpetrator has to have the intention to exploit the victim sexually.

In German criminal law human trafficking (§180b StGB) is defined as undue enrichment by exerting an influence over a person in dire (financial) straits, to prostitute herself to the benefit of the perpetrator (Abs. 1 Satz 1). This is being sanctioned by a fine or imprisonment up to five years. Profiting from or facilitating the sexual exposure or prostitution of a helpless person in a foreign country for financial gain (Abs. 1 Satz 1 and 2) can result in imprisonment of up to ten years. Added is facilitation of sexual action with minors (under 16) sanctioned by a fine or imprisonment up to five years.

Procurement is treated as a concomitant crime of human trafficking and forced prostitution and is regulated in article 181 of the Criminal Code, where persons exploiting sex workers or gaining pecuniary advantages by controlling and directing sex workers or procuring contacts with clients are to be sanctioned by imprisonment of up to three years. The interest protected by this law is the sexual self-determination of sex workers and their personal freedom to decide upon their sexual contacts; while the punishable crime is the forced dependency of the sex worker and the impairment of their personal autonomy.

---

<sup>1</sup> The Protection of Prostitution Act (ProstSchG) was adopted in October 2016 and put in force in July 2017. Core elements are a licence necessary for any kind of sex work, in order to fight criminality and protect the sex workers. Since its implementation, the law has been discussed controversially.

The data summarised and analysed here reflect on the numbers and assessments as published in the annual reports of the German Federal Office of Criminal Investigation (Bundeskriminalamt, BKA). The overview of the situation with human trafficking as published by the BKA is based on numbers of completed investigations (Bundeskriminalamt, 2017). In addition to literature research (academic literature and press reporting of relevant cases), nine expert interviews were conducted. Four interviews were conducted in the Bundesland Bremen with police officers working in the departments countering human trafficking and forced prostitution (GE-E1/4).<sup>2</sup> The officers are responsible for the cities of Bremen and Bremerhaven. Another two interviews took place with prosecutors having worked on cases in the trafficking in human beings (THB) for sexual exploitation field (GE-E5/6). They were especially relevant to contextualise the difficulties of THB trials and the role of victim support organisations as main witnesses in these kinds of trials. Two interviews were then conducted with members of NGOs engaged in victim protection in the context of THB for sexual exploitation (GE-E7/8) and one with a politician who organised several conferences in this field and was engaged in an awareness raising campaign (GE-E9). The interview sample was chosen to best represent the case of Bremen as a Bundesland. A deeper qualitative insight into one case was preferred to a broader national focus that would necessarily have been more superficial.

## 1. MARKET OVERVIEW

“Human trafficking and forced prostitution are so called ‘control crimes,’ i.e. if you do not control, there is no reported criminality in this field. Therefore, the number of unrecorded crimes correlates with the energy we put into investigations. Unfortunately, in Bremen the number of investigators is not sufficient to fully uncover the underlying structures in this field” (GE-E4).

Usually, it is women who become victims of human trafficking for sexual exploitation, while men more probably become victims of human trafficking for labour exploitation. The majority of traffickers as well as their victims come from Germany or from southeast European countries.

In 2016, for the first time statistical data on the exploitation of minors were collected. Specific exploitation practices and dependency relations of the victims and their exploiters, who often come from the victims’ close social or familial environment, make investigations particularly difficult. Therefore, trafficking of minors has been extended to commercial sexual exploitation of minors. “This includes sexual abuse by adults and payment of the child or of a third person in monetary or other form. The child is not only treated as a sex object but also as a commodity”

---

<sup>2</sup> The sources have been coded in order to preserve their anonymity. The first two letters of the code indicate the country, “E” indicates an expert. The description of the background of the individual sources referenced can be found in the list of interviewees in the references section.

(Bundeskriminalamt, 2017). In 2016, 145 investigations with 214 minor victims were conducted.

In 2016, 363 investigations were completed in the field of human trafficking for sexual exploitation. Compared to the previous year (364 investigations) the number remained constant. The share of investigations with only German victims was 20% (2015: 24%), i.e. most investigations were related to proceedings related to foreign victims.

Compared to 2015, the distribution of the proceedings at the regional level remained stable. About 60% of the investigations took place in the federal states of North Rhine-Westfalia, Berlin and Lower Saxony. The different quantity of reported cases is to be attributed to different prioritisations by local police as well as to the existence of specialised departments. The number of labour exploitation investigations decreased in 2016. Twelve investigations were closed in 2016, seven fewer than in 2015 (19). Twenty-seven suspects were involved in the trials (2015: 24), as well as 48 victims (2015: 54).

**TABLE 1. COMPARISON OF INVESTIGATION STATISTICS FOR SEXUAL AND LABOUR EXPLOITATION, 2016**

| Sexual exploitation     | Labour exploitation     |
|-------------------------|-------------------------|
| 363 investigations      | 12 investigations       |
| 524 suspects            | 27 suspects             |
| 488 victims             | 48 victims              |
| 95% female              | 71% male                |
| 85% victims from Europe | 75% victims from Europe |

Source: *Bundeskriminalamt.*

Concerning THB for sexual exploitation, the annual national BKA reports show a decline in investigated suspects. In 2016, there were altogether 524 suspects registered in the concluded investigations. Compared to 2015 this is a decline of 9%. German suspects were the biggest group (145: 28%), followed by Bulgarian (81: 16%) and Romanian (78: 15%) suspects (Poland: 12, Turkey: 27, Hungary: 39, other: 37, Africa: 16, Asia: 13, America: 3, unknown: 73). Eighty percent (419) of the perpetrators were Europeans and 73% of the suspected traffickers were male (381).<sup>3</sup>

Nigerian criminal networks form an exception insofar as women play a central role in the exploitation process (Europol, 2016). The typical structure of criminal groups engaged in THB consists of loose networks linked by kinship or ethnic ties (Europol, 2016). According to findings of

<sup>3</sup> For 19 suspects no further information could be obtained.

Europol, people from Nigeria are mainly engaged in THB from Africa for sexual exploitation. After recruitment in their home country the victims are smuggled, given identity documents and then transferred to prostitution businesses. Often the traffickers use voodoo rituals, especially the so called *juju* to exert pressure. As a result, the willingness of the victims to testify against their traffickers in court is particularly low. In the countries of destination, the distribution of the victims is usually organised by women ("madams"). The latter often bring them into different European countries on a rotating principle. Nigerian THB groups are highly organised, their division of labour and specialisation are very pronounced, and groups of perpetrators react with high flexibility to law enforcement countermeasures. Once discovered by police, smuggling routes or transfer hubs can be changed on short notice. The Europe-wide networks, which can be based either on family or on business ties within the ethnic communities in the destination countries, enable a quick flow of information.

On average, less than two suspects were identified per investigation. However, according to police findings there are underlying complex structures of criminal organisations, e.g. networks connected via common cultural background or kinship, which are most flexible and adaptable. This manifests in their transnational activity, distributing their victims among various countries and regularly replacing them. They evade control and quickly move towards new more profitable opportunities, such as permanently changing the location of exploitation in order to maximize their profit with a parallel reduction of the risk to be caught. In 2016, assets worth €2.5 million were temporarily seized, a sum significantly higher than the €512,000 of 2015.

A history of relations between the trafficker and the victim facilitates the state of dependence of the latter. Many of the investigated suspects knew beforehand the victims they then sexually exploited (217 suspects, 41%); 22 of the suspects even had kinship relations (4%), only 34% of the suspects had no former relation to their victims.

Often trafficker and victim share ethnic, cultural or national background, thus facilitating the establishment of the dependency of the victim. The same is true for the common language, especially when victims only speak the language of their traffickers and not the language of their destination country. This makes it easy for traffickers to keep the victims dependent and instil in them fear from the local authorities.

The primary cause of what at a later stage might become forced prostitution is the existence of an illegitimate opportunity structure and a socialisation method teaching women that sexuality can be exchanged for money. Often, it is at a later stage that coercion replaces the initial motivation of an easy high income (Stallberg, 1999: 603f.). Drug consumption (alcohol and other) is quite common as a coping strategy of the sex workers when they feel disgust towards their clients (Girtler, 2004: 61ff.; 70ff.; 91ff.). Together with a typical and ostentatious handling of luxury status symbols it discourages women from leaving the exploitative business and makes the differentiation between forced and voluntary prostitution difficult (Boatca, 2003).

### The victims

From the 48 identified victims 34 were male and 13 female, in one case the sex was unknown. NGOs in this field state that women are increasingly exploited as domestic helpers, carers or seamstresses in workshops. More than half of the victims were from Ukraine (25 persons, 52%), followed by Polish citizens (8 persons, 17%). While in 2015 34 Bulgarian victims were identified, in 2016 there were only 3 (6%). Labour exploitation takes place mainly in the construction sector, where most victims were identified (12 persons), although in the previous year it was the agricultural sector that was prevalent.

The majority of the victims (54%) were under 21 years old. In 68 lawsuits closed by the police 77 victims were under 18 years of age, which means that about every fifth victim of human trafficking for sexual exploitation was a minor. Of the under-18 victims, 39% confirm that they had been involved in prostitution. This might lead to the conclusion that it is especially minors who are attracted into human trafficking by the lover-boy method (Bundeskriminalamt, 2016: 10). The underage victims are usually to be encountered in bars and brothels. This mirrors the picture we have from adult victims, of whom 39% also were active in prostitution in bars and brothels. Thirty-four percent were prostituting themselves in flats, 19% offer hotel and home visits and 14% were working in the street (Bundeskriminalamt, 2016). In 2016, 488 victims were investigated that had been trafficked for sexual exploitation. Compared to the previous year's number (416) this was an increase of about 17%, while in a five-year perspective it was under the average (523). As in the preceding year, around 95% of the victims were women (466).

German victims had the biggest share – 127 (26%; 2015: 97, 23%). Usually, they know their rights, trust executive authorities and are often socially better integrated. They are less reluctant to turn to the police and to report the exploitative nature of their occupation. Still, despite their higher consciousness of victimhood, emotional dependency based on a supposed love relationship often enough inhibits them to free themselves from this kind of exploitative relationship.

The second most common nationality of victims was Bulgarian (92, 19%; 2015: 71, 17%), followed by Romanian victims (76 victims, 16%; 2015: 98 victims, 24%). The share of victims from America and Asia remained at about the same level as in 2015. Most non-European victims come from Africa. Their numbers rose from 20 in 2015 to 36 in 2016. The number of victims from Nigeria more than doubled in 2016 (25) compared to 2015 (10).

Another 145 cases were investigated where **commercial exploitation of minors** was the primary crime.<sup>4</sup> In these cases, an overall of 214 vic-

<sup>4</sup> § 176 (5) StGB – Sexual abuse of children; § 176a (3) StGB – heavy sexual abuse of children; § 180 (1) and (2) StGB – facilitation of sexual action of minors; § 182 (2) StGB – sexual abuse of adolescents; § 235 (4) Nr. 2 StGB – abduction of minors; § 236 (1-5) StGB – trade of children.

tims who were minors were identified, of whom 180 were between 14 and 17 years old, and over two thirds were female (145 victims, 68%). German victims represented the majority with round 72% (155 persons); far fewer numbers were from other nationalities, e.g. Hungarian (7 victims), Bosnia and Herzegovina or Romania (6 victims each).

Altogether 186 suspects engaged in the sexual exploitation of minors were identified. Most of them (111 persons, 60%) were of German citizenship with an average age of 35 years.<sup>5</sup> More than a third of the suspects (65) were younger than 30 years, 14 of them even being minors themselves. Almost half (83 persons, 45%) of the suspects had no former relation to the victim; a third knew the victims (62 persons), and another 11 suspects were related to the victims. In many cases the initial contact took place via the internet or via social media (67 victims each). In 10 cases the lover-boy method came into play, all involving girls between 14 and 17 years.<sup>6</sup>

In the cases of THB for sexual exploitation half of the victims declared that they had agreed to prostitute (48 of the 96 minor victims). Related to the overall case number most of the victims were sexually abused and exploited (102 of 214). Seventy-four victims were found prostituting themselves in hotels or flats, while 17 victims were abused for child pornography. Most of the cases in preliminary investigations (around 60%) were conducted in North Rhine-Westphalia, Berlin and Lower Saxony. THB for sexual exploitation almost exclusively is related to prostitution. The varying number of cases is due to different factors such as the dimension of the red light districts, the priorities of law enforcement agencies and the existence of special administrative offices for the respective milieu.

Besides THB and exploitation there are also other offences usually treated as accessory crimes. In 2016, in about every second case additional offences were investigated (188 cases, 52%; 2015: 60%). The total number of accessory offences declined with 270 compared to 2015 (307), in most of the cases it was a matter of bodily harm and offences against sexual self-determination. A main facilitator for investigations has been the initiation of contact between police and victims. Case investigations are usually initiated by police following evidence or after a complaint (153: 42%). In 66 cases (18%) police initiated investigations. In the remaining 144 proceedings the victims alone or accompanied by counsellors or other third persons (e.g. other sex workers or clients) contacted the police.

---

<sup>5</sup> In 28 of the 186 cases the age of the suspect remained unknown.

<sup>6</sup> In 30 cases no information on the relation between suspects and victims could be identified.

## 2. MARKET STRUCTURE AND SOCIAL ORGANISATION OF TRAFFICKING NETWORKS

“In Bremen around 90% of the suspects are from a non-German background. Forced prostitution is seen as a consequent phenomenon to social inequality between countries, for example between countries such as Bulgaria or Romania and Germany” (GE-E1). “The most common ethnic background of the victims in Bremen was Bulgarian and Hungarian, while in other federal states problems often revolve around THB from Nigeria” (GE-E5).

The initial situation of the victims usually is migration and lack of prospects, and the individual decision to migrate is most usually not taken in a spontaneous manner. The contrast between the financial circumstances and the general living conditions in the countries of origin related to high unemployment, low wages, lack of social security and political uprooting, and the relatively high level of prosperity in other EU countries, significantly raises the willingness and preparedness to migrate (Koelges, 2003).

In THB cases three phases can be distinguished. In the **first phase** women from economically less developed countries with relatively low educational level willing to migrate are being recruited (GE-E2). These potential victims are promised a lucrative job abroad. Depending on the background of the women the promised job can be prostitution (when the women have a social background in this milieu), but it can also be a promised position in geriatric care, gastronomy, or being a nursemaid for well-off German families. Another typical recruitment tactic is the above mentioned lover-boy method, allowing emotional control of the victims (GE-E2).

**The second phase** begins when the potential victim accepts the offer. Then middlemen or facilitators provide the necessary documents and organise the transfer. During the trip usually the identity papers of the women are taken away under false pretence. Most of the women tell that they expected to have them back after arrival, but normally this is not the case. However, “once the women work in forced prostitution it creates less suspicion when they can show their papers in police controls” (GE-E2).

Most women recognise their dependent situation already during the trip to the target country. If they try to defend themselves they would usually experience violence for the first time. Once arrived in the target country, the women are usually brought directly into brothels or the model flats where they are being introduced by the traffickers or other forced prostitutes into their future work conditions (GE-E2).

An illustrative case is being recounted by an employee of a victim support organisation. The victim from Bulgaria was approached at a supermarket parking lot and did not hesitate to join the foreigners who promised her a lucrative job in Germany. She had not realised the risk



she was taking until they reached the border. When she tried to leave, she was forcefully prevented from doing so (GE-E8). Apparently her desperation and lack of prospects as well as her hope to improve her living conditions were immensely high.

Most of the time, THB takes place in small businesses, in rented flats where one or two women work around the clock and promote their sex services online. One man might control several flats while the owner of the flats is being paid cash a sum that is much higher than the typical rate and of course only pays taxes on the officially declared amount. The trafficker normally collects the earnings on a daily basis, often enough controlling the number of clients either by being present or by installing cameras. In some cases, couriers are used, who might also transfer the money to the trafficker's home country. But usually it is the trafficker himself who sends money back home via financial service providers such as Western Union. In order to maintain their profitability, women are often moved either between flats or between cities. "In one case we had a flat owner who rented out several flats in the same city where women could move, as a new woman always earns more money; once clients get to know her, her and the pimp's income decreases" (GE-E6).

As prostitution is not forbidden, the delict is the exploitation of the sex worker. "Exploitation can mean that a sex worker might earn €500 per day, but she has to give €450 to the trafficker" (GE-E4). A prosecutor noted that it would be a far less criminalised business, if the traffickers would be less greedy and allow the sex workers to keep more of their earnings (GE-E6). The way earnings are kept very low for the women is exemplified by the case of a woman who had to come from her current working place in Frankfurt to Bremen for an investigation. She worked in a club (with hygienic and security infrastructure) paying a daily room rent of €150 per day and getting €20 per client. That means in order to earn €10, she had to service eight clients. Of course, this cannot directly be labelled forced prostitution, but it has a lot to do with exploitation (GE-E1).

"In the case of victims with Bulgarian background in Bremen we did not see organised crime involvement. Car trading usually is the first excuse of traffickers of women. And often they also trade cars between the countries, as this is not necessarily illegal" (GE-E5).

Traffickers are quite mobile, as their business model is based on a regularly changing supply of women (GE-E4). Often enough the perpetrators are single actors or pairs, pimps who know each other and sometimes exchange women. Typical for forced prostitution is a rotation of the victims that is orientated at the client's preferences (GE-E8). For that traffickers have put up a network that can be used for the exchange of women. These either remain owned by their pimp or they are sold for a lump sum (GE-E2). Still, traffickers do not seem to cooperate intensively (GE-E5). Contrary to other actors – such as for example illegal motorbike gangs (e.g. Hell's Angels) who often run brothels on their wives' names – the Bulgarian traffickers did not use legal businesses as bogus firms (GE-E5).

The control methods are physical as well as psychological: "The victims are usually not allowed to leave the flats unaccompanied. They are told that they have to be protected from foreign pimps or that they risk being arrested by the police. Of course, the real reason behind that precaution is to prevent any contact that could enable the victims to leave" (GE-E1).

Deception is the most widespread means of recruitment. More than a quarter of the investigated victims (28%) state that they had by and large agreed to prostitute, but they were being deceived about the actual circumstances concerning the sort and extent of prostitution as well the earnings. Twenty-two percent were deceived into prostituting themselves, usually by the traffickers pretending a love relationship that pushes the victims into emotional dependency from where they were guided into prostitution and exploitation. This lover-boy method has been used with German, Romanian, and Ukrainian victims. Most of them were between 19 and 26 years old. When recruiting by this method, young and attractive men contact girls or young women with low self-esteem or weak social bonds in order to introduce them into prostitution. Then, they fake financial distress, in order to have the women prostitute themselves voluntarily because of the created emotional dependency. Later, this preliminary voluntariness becomes enforcement.

Around 10% of the victims became professional via model or artist management agencies used as a front, or via advertisements in newspapers. Another 10% of the victims were forced into prostitution via physical, and 8% via psychological violence. The family context played a major role for 9% of the investigated victims. Especially for victims from Romania and Bulgaria it often was a family member who led the women into prostitution.

Most victims were found in private contexts and in hotels. Although most of the forced sex work in Germany still takes place in bars and brothels (41% of the victims). Between a quarter and a third of the victims (29%) prostitute themselves in flats or hotels, while street prostitution was less popular (12%). There has been a shift from the typical prostitution in brothels towards the less controllable prostitution in private settings and hotels. This also requires an increased use of the internet for enabling contact between clients and sex workers.

In Bremen, most victims of forced prostitution work in private flats where health care is not available and violence, including regular and sometimes collective rape, is a common means of control. Often the traffickers share housing with their victims (GE-E4). Many victims tacitly accept their destiny out of fear and desperation, as open resistance only creates more violence, including threats of violence against family members (Hofmann, 2002; Koelges, 2003; GE-E1).

In their helpless situation victims are easily blackmailed, for example by exploiting their visa status or their supposed debt for transport, rent, etc. (Koelges, 2003). Beyond those punishments victims are also often threatened with police, as in the countries they come from sometimes

they have had very negative experiences, including forced sex with police officers (GE-E2).

**The third phase** describes the (attempt of) manipulation of the victims during a THB investigation or trial. Usually traffickers exert strong influence over the victims, since they have large networks at their disposal and also threaten their families in their countries of origin, and so prevent the revealing of detailed evidence. From a police perspective this poses great challenges, as often even in cases where police cooperation takes place security cannot be guaranteed (GE-E2).

Threats and systematic intimidation can have multiple forms. For women from Africa often voodoo spells are used, putting the victims under such enormous pressure that they often withdraw their evidence, while being they are too ashamed and afraid to tell the authorities about the real reasons (GE-E8).

This kind of Transnational ties were uncovered when police noticed that some German cities were closely connected with Bulgarian cities, such as Bremen with Pleven for example. Prior to the Bulgarian connections, the networks active in Bremen originated mainly in Ukraine or Belarus (GE-E4). Often the initial method of bringing women was through familial relations; later, these women then bring in their friends.

A police investigator reported that after having conducted many interrogations he understood that victims often live and work in very difficult conditions without perceiving themselves as victims. "From our perspective this is not understandable, but their starting points are often living conditions that are far worse" (GE-E4). Still, sometimes even for them the situation becomes unbearable.

Most women work every day and have to serve a number of clients. They also work without condoms or engage in any sexual practices when clients wish so (Koelges, 2003). They often do not get any health care or social welfare. Even minor diseases (such as bladder infections or mycosis), if not taken care of can become chronic; unwanted pregnancies occur and, of course, sex workers are more often infected with contagious sexual diseases than the average population. Public health authorities being aware of these problems also try to establish trust relations with the women by no-questions-asked distribution of medicine (GE-E8).

In Bremen, the type of red-light milieu facilitates private prostitution in model flats. Around 34% of the victims of THB prostitute themselves in private flats (Bundeskriminalamt, 2016). Here, they often work unnoticed by the public and are not allowed to leave the locations unaccompanied. As they often do not speak the language of the country they live in they usually lack personal contacts, an important factor intensifying helplessness and dependency.<sup>7</sup> There are around 85 houses and 250 flats in

---

<sup>7</sup> The prevalent type of prostitution determines the accessibility of potential victims to the police. Street prostitution and brothels are known locations and therefore more easily controlled, but private flats, where rotation of different women takes place, are more anonymous and not always easy to be found (GE-E2).

Bremen where women prostitute themselves. The flats are situated in different suburbs, but according to the website *hostessen-meile.com*,<sup>8</sup> most of them are to be found in Bremen Neustadt, around the Osterdeich and in Hastedt. Most flats are in anonymous complexes, where no neighbourhood communities exist, and where people do not pay attention to prostitution. "These flats are being rented on a daily or weekly basis, which raises the debt of the victims towards their traffickers" (GE-E2).

Although not all such places are related to THB for sexual exploitation, this is the most common manifestation of it. Most of the women as well as their pimps working here come from Bulgaria or Romania or have their roots in other east European countries. Most victims are quite young, but usually minors are not advertised, as that would create problems and they are rather promoted privately. In terms of the number of investigations, "Bremen is currently in the middle position after having been leading the statistics for some years" (GE-E2).

The non-public sex market is the critical point in Bremen compared to other, bigger cities. The most prominent locations are Helenenstrasse and Cuxhavener Strasse. On Helenenstrasse (known as a brothel street since 1878) there are 27 houses where women prostitute themselves. These houses are owned by different persons, and the women earn at least €30 per half an hour, with an average of €50 (GE-E2). On Cuxhavener Strasse, where women also prostitute themselves on the street, the average fee is €20 (GE-E2).

Victims and traffickers often are Roma, coming from poor backgrounds, with no education. Neither criminality nor prostitution seem to be morally or socially sanctioned. Victims are being promised lots of money, but at the end they earn very little and are happy if they can send €50 home (GE-E5). Often the whole network of persons are related to each other, or know each other from their villages. Typically, the women knew what they were heading for, although they first tell the police other stories because they feel embarrassed. Once they build trust relationships with the NGO workers they confess that they knew that they were expected to prostitute themselves (GE-E5).

Different intensities of violence have been observed. Some traffickers are very brutal – their victims have to work 18 hours per day and they are beaten and mistreated when they fall asleep. When recruitment takes place via the lover-boy method, the women believe that they are in an emotional relationship with their trafficker and earn money for them both. This is quite a common method also used by motorbike gangs to recruit rather weak and easily manipulated personalities (GE-E5). Cases with women of this kind as witnesses are very difficult to be investigated, as "one day they testify one thing and the next day another" (GE-E5).

Investigations, however, depend on their testimonies, as there is almost no other objective documentary evidence. Usually, investigators search

---

<sup>8</sup> The website publishes photos, services offered, addresses of the flats and related telephone numbers (GE-E2).

for a 24-hour service offered online which is an indication that the service is probably not voluntarily offered by the woman (GE-E5). These women are very difficult witnesses, since they are often traumatised and ashamed; often they do not tell everything in the first police interrogation because they are embarrassed to have been taken in by the trafficker. They do not know if they can trust the police, as often they may have had bad experiences in their home countries, where Roma often face discrimination. “Then it is difficult for the prosecutor, because in the fourth or fifth interrogation they confess how they have been mistreated or raped or so” (GE-E5).

The victims are very scared of the traffickers, because they often come from the same village and they know the families of the victims. There have been cases where threats against families took place or where money was paid to have the victims take back their testimonies (GE-E5).

When working with Bulgarian authorities, for example, it was very common that witnesses withdrew their testimonies. “The family against which we investigated at that time in [the Bulgarian city of] Pleven was kind of untouchable and they might have also corrupted local authorities, considering that the families of the victim never got any response to their complaints about their missing daughter” (GE-E5). Therefore, the investments for the protection of victims are quite high, since without their evidence there would be no sentences at all; and without sentences, there would be no profit forfeiture either (GE-E4). In one case, a whole family – including the women – was involved in trafficking women for sexual exploitation. While in other types of crime women are about 10% of the perpetrators, in the case of THB they are nearly 50%.

“Sometimes it resembles the Stockholm syndrome, when the victims feel empathy for the traffickers. In one case the prosecutor recounts that three of the victims were in love with their trafficker, although he had exploited, beaten and violated them. If he gave them €50 or took them out they felt loved by him. While some of the victims understand quickly and flee at a very early stage, those who do not get out quickly stay for longer – in one case for about eight years, in other cases three to four years” (GE-E4).

### 3. FINANCING AND FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT

The cases investigated in Bremen suggest that there is no need of initial capital for kick-starting a THB operation. The first investment is in the transport of women, whether forced or persuaded into this business. This costs between €80 and €150 per person in minivans and is not a great investment (GE-E5, GE-E4). Usually this is paid by the traffickers, but in some cases women pay themselves (GE-E4). Locations then need to be found for practicing prostitution, but this is not a great investment either (GE-E4). As these women earn money from the very first day of

their arrival, the advanced amount is soon recovered and they can also pay for their rooms.

Bigger amounts are needed if one would like to open a brothel or a bar, where a thousand euro would have to be invested to raise the visibility of the business and make the building recognisable from the outside and also install the necessary hygienic and security standards, but for the model flats in the city there is no extra investment necessary.

The flats are provided by local owners who get far higher rents for their properties than they would get in the normal market. If, for example, a flat with three rooms in a given urban area could normally be rented for €400 per month, the rent for a flat being used for prostitution would be ten times higher, while taxes would only be paid on the officially declared sum of €400 (GE-E5).

The owner of the building, who usually is not the trafficker himself, gets around €50 per day per woman. Normally he is paid by the pimp who collects the money on a daily basis, while the taxes he pays are calculated on the low price as fixed in a written contract. The owner of the building usually confirms that from his perspective there is no forced prostitution visible, and he always has had the impression of happy, voluntarily working prostitutes (if, of course he acknowledges that he knew how they used the flat).<sup>9</sup> In the assumed three rooms there would be three women working, earning around €500 each per day, so “there is quasi financial risk at all for entering the THB business” (GE-E4). Even if a trafficker is caught, as long as he is able to recruit new victims, he will face no great challenges to getting back into business. He might even have access to capital that had not been confiscated by the law enforcement authorities (GE-E4).

Depending on the number of clients a sex worker could make around €2,000 per day, of which the trafficker takes the major part. Another part is used to pay for the rooms, often enough to German house owners (GE-E4).

The victims are told that they owe the traffickers a lot of money and that their keeping also costs quite a lot. Sometimes they are being threatened that they might be resold to more brutal traffickers. Usually victims are not even allowed to leave the flats unaccompanied, not even to go to the supermarket to buy food. They are told that they have a debt to pay off, but its amount never decreases, be it because of running costs, be it because they are told that huge investments were made to buy them from other traffickers or other implausible stories (GE-E5).

Sex workers give the money to the trafficker either directly after each client, or in other cases they put it in a box and the pimp collects

---

<sup>9</sup> A THB case with Bulgarian networks involved one flat owner who declared that the women always laughed when he met them in his different flats. Although at the trial he was forbidden to rent his flats to prostitutes, he might be back in the business, as the buildings usually are in a rather poor condition and would never fetch good prices at the regular house-renting market.

the boxes when he makes his round each day. It depends on the trust level or on the means of control (e.g. cameras) that exist between the trafficker and the victim. If money is being withheld by the victim usually violence comes into play. Sometimes certain victims are entrusted to enforce control over other victims, and then they might collect the money. If the trafficker is travelling they also might send it via Western Union, as normally neither of them have bank accounts in Germany. Western Union allows direct transfer between two persons, but the transaction costs are quite high. Nevertheless, transactions of amounts such as €50 with fees of €8 are observed. The daily collection of money ensures that the women do not keep anything for themselves, and even if they run away, they cannot take a lot of money with them.

Sometimes, if the trafficker is controlling several women, he might use a “helping hand” giving them €50 or so for collecting the money, but these are usually costs that are avoided. In cases where there is only one woman, the pimp could be in the next room counting the clients, thus knowing exactly how much money the woman earns (GE-E4).

The 2017 Protection of Prostitution Act might make THB for sexual exploitation less attractive for the traffickers as it will decrease their profits (GE-E5). At the same time, the profits of the traffickers feed into a ostentatious lifestyle, with expensive cars, houses and gold jewellery usually in their countries of origin.

### **The role and impact of the internet on human trafficking activities and finances**

The role of the internet rises and it is becoming an increasingly relevant instrument in the recruitment process as well as a promotional platform for prostitution. Especially when the victims are minors, this has been a common way for initiating a first contact with the trafficker. The increasing relocation of prostitution into private flats and hotels is going hand in hand with an extensive online communication and has already led to significant structural changes in the red-light milieu. This poses new challenges to law enforcement authorities.

The internet played a relevant role in the recruitment of 53 victims (11%). The lover-boy method acquires a special relevance also in social networks and dating platforms. Traffickers search and contact young women in social networks or dating platforms and then strive to establish a relationship based on emotional dependency in order to push them into prostitution. Perpetrators also recruit on job platforms in Germany deceiving the victims about the conditions and the actual nature of the job.

Furthermore, the internet provides sex workers and their clients with the opportunity of contact outside of the milieu, while the pimps and traffickers enjoy a much broader flexibility in the acquisition of clients. The initiation of contact through street prostitution or in a brothel is no longer necessary, since an online offer and the provision of an

alternative location for the sexual intercourse (flat, hotel room) suffice. When solicitation takes place online, also the presentation of identity papers can be avoided. This increases the risk that sexually exploited sex workers and underage victims are no longer discovered by the police.

Given the high number of online advertisements of sex workers and the fact that this is the only visible presence of these persons, the differentiation between voluntary sex workers and forced prostitution becomes extremely difficult. The identification of victims also becomes more difficult, and it is to be expected that perpetrators in the future will make more use of the internet to contact and recruit potential victims. This development changes the overall framework of the red-light milieu and poses new challenges for police and law enforcement agencies (Bundeskriminalamt, 2017).

A case in point is the organisation of human traffickers who recruited women in Serbia and Bosnia and Herzegovina. The women were promised decent jobs in Germany, but were instead sexually exploited in different hotels. These victims were advertised online and because of their lack of language skills the advertisement were designed and organised by the traffickers. This also applied to the first contacts between prostitutes and clients, which were enabled and handled by the trafficker. This modus operandi seems to be spreading in Europe at the moment. It includes the offering by human traffickers of victims for sexual exploitation using alternative locations, thus thwarting the efforts of police forces (Bundeskriminalamt, 2017).

In general, it is advertising rather than recruitment that the internet is used for, as in most cases victims and traffickers knew each other in their home countries already (GE-E5). And while the flats as unofficial brothels are not always visible in the streets and even the door bells only sometimes say "Massage" or something similar, the internet provides a different kind of visibility. It also reduces the investment costs, as traffickers do not need to buy ads in the local newspaper any more, but when it comes to tracking down profits it is of little use and has no impact on the financial investigations (GE-E4). Most clients still prefer to pay cash and keep their anonymity – prostitution remains a cash business (GE-E4).

Beyond the private ads, there are forums where clients describe and discuss the quality and details of the sex services. When the sex worker is being treated as any other goods it can be very derogatory and misogynist. Most websites have a reference to forced prostitution and provide information and the possibility to report if a client suspects something in that direction (GE-E2).



#### 4. FINANCIAL INVESTIGATIONS OF THB CRIMES: CHALLENGES AND GOOD PRACTICES

In April 2016, the BKA initiated a Europe-wide operation against THB from western Africa for a third time. In cooperation with Europol locations of prostitution and entry of potential victims of THB at international airports in 17 European countries were controlled. Four hundred women were identified who had probably been victims of trafficking for sexual exploitation. Meanwhile, police inspected more than 650 brothels or similar establishments in Germany, while at the same time border police intensified controls at airports. The European cooperation becomes more and more relevant for the fight against THB. The Europe-wide control actions assist the identification of victims and organisers as well as the initiation of court proceedings (Bundeskriminalamt, 2017).

Whenever there is evidence of exploitation of women, a special unit begins to search for the profits of that crime and looks at the money flows (GE-E4). In that milieu it is common to have cash flows than transfers via accounts, which means that revenues are to be found in cash. "If, say, 15 flats are rented and €50 per flat per day is collected, then there is already a certain amount to be managed. The investigation team then looks into the financial assets of the suspects and they check their accounts and expenses. Do they pay cash into their accounts? Are they transferring money abroad or to other persons? Do they work, own real estate, cars or other financial assets?" (GE-E4).

When profits are still available, law enforcement can – by using the provisions of paragraph §73c of the new law – calculate the overall amount. Through evidence from witnesses, observations, analysis, etc., law enforcement can calculate the number of women in flats and from there the earnings. This can be up to six-digit euro amounts in case, for example, that an offence for a period of six months for about twenty flats can be proven. This then defines the payment claims towards the perpetrators. If victims claim they had been exploited for that period of time and it is known that there were six other women in this house, the police can calculate the profits of the one who rents them the house (in this case it would be around €100,000). The trafficker's profit lies above that sum, as he takes more than the €50 room rent per day from the women. The total amount is then estimated and the assets defined as payment claims are confiscated. This means that his cars, cash, and jewellery can be confiscated, but also accounts seized, and mortgage can be taken out on real estate. International investigations allow searches to be carried out abroad, and when international cooperation functions well, also legally purchased assets can be seized (GE-E4).

When the direct profits from THB cannot be found, the financial investigation team is allowed to seize all other assets. Many traffickers do not know this (GE-E4). It is also possible to confiscate money when it has been moved illegally to friends, wives, etc. This is regulated in the confiscation provision of §73, stating that third persons who in the meantime have been given the profits can also be prosecuted. The idea

is to identify the profit from THB and then compensate unequal asset distribution resulting from the criminal behaviour. This has been set in criminal law for some time, but only after the 1990s it has been regularly applied by involving financial investigation teams from the very beginning (GE-E5). Now it has been expanded to all assets, even those of legal origin (GE-E4).

Typical assets in THB crimes are those in legal accounts and real estate, often enough abroad. Significantly, the investments of the trafficker are not part of the calculation, i.e. “the confiscated amount is more than the net profit, it covers all the investigated income, as the investments had been deliberately made in illegal activities, and crime shall not pay” (GE-E4). This is called the “gross-net-principle” (Brutto-Netto-Prinzip).<sup>10</sup> After the calculation of the profits, an asset confiscation is being enacted and executed on all assets found among the group of suspects or moved to third persons. The relevant provisions in this field of asset forfeiture in the context of THB trials are paragraphs §73ff. and §111b StPO (GE-E4).

An important part, especially in transnational settings, is to trace money flows when traffickers have used financial services such as Western Union and MoneyGram. In the first years, when Western Union began its business, they did not even ask for ID cards. Now both sides – the payer as well as the receiver abroad – need to identify themselves, which allows to investigate each transaction of specified persons in a defined period of time. “Traffickers who do not officially live here do not open bank accounts, but transfer regularly their cash money to countries like Bulgaria, Belarus or Turkey” (GE-E4).

Still, there are various challenges in international cooperation and many bureaucratic hurdles to overcome in investigating and prosecuting THB. Although the flow of cash can be obscured, often law enforcement knows that the traffickers transfer it to their home country (GE-E6). In some cases, German law enforcement would send the court documents and the sentence and the Bulgarian authorities would proceed with the forfeiture. Cooperation in this field has great potential for improvement (GE-E6).

When, for example, a German prosecutor tries to confiscate assets of traffickers in Bulgaria, during a process where the German financial investigation team had found assets in Bulgaria, a more intensive financial investigation on the ground and less bureaucracy would facilitated a more efficient asset freezing and confiscation (GE-E6). Usually, there is no German financial investigation on assets abroad and it depends on the local structures, if confiscated money will at the end be distributed among the victims. If these two investigations take place separately, the trials become even more complicated and less victims might testify against their traffickers. Currently, cooperation is established with Hong Kong and Thailand.

---

<sup>10</sup> Following the “gross-principle” of confiscation, the investments of the trafficker are not subtracted from the confiscated sum. This means that more than just the profit can be confiscated; unfortunately, usually it is only a small fraction of it.

It causes much more difficulties when separate trials are initiated – one for THB and one for money laundering. Germany has specialised prosecutors on this issue, and it is integrated into the other trials. That means that once a witness declares that she has earned €250 per day one can immediately confiscate that money calculated for a year for example, in order to make it available to the victim. That also means that immediately after the amount has been calculated all assets from real estate, cars or cash can be frozen until at the end of the trial a decision upon its final and definitive confiscation is made.

In Bulgaria, as in other countries as well, asset forfeiture is not integrated into the THB trial, but is a matter of a new trial, with another responsible authority. A lot of synergy effects are being lost when these two issues are handled separately. If this part is tried after the main trial, usually there is no money left, as the traffickers had enough time to remove everything valuable.

In Germany, the reform in this field allows to distrain all different kinds of assets, and victims having claims can be remunerated from the confiscated sums. Of course, this is only possible when there is enough money to be distributed among the victims. Usually, this is not the case and the distribution of the perpetrators' assets has to be divided along quotas.

The most successful use of this instrument is very early involvement in the main investigation, in order to understand the underlying structures of the respective case (GE-E4). The earlier the financial investigation is involved into the process, the more detailed will be the knowledge about the possessions of the suspects that often are not to be found in Germany. Therefore, the police consider it as luck when the suspects are arrested just after collecting the daily earnings.

Unfortunately, cash can be hidden quite easily and it can only be found if police gets some hints (GE-E4). It can also be handed over to a friend abroad, and once money is transferred directly and not via any accounts, its track is lost (GE-E4). For other assets it is different: in Germany, unlike in Bulgaria, for example, it is impossible to buy a house with cash, money has to be transferred via bank accounts.

The most problematic situation is when cash is transferred abroad, hidden in one way or another. Before traffickers began to use Western Union or MoneyGram the most common way was to take the cash back to their home countries in the same minivan that had been used for the transport of women, hidden or distributed in little packets among some passengers (GE-E4).

Still, in many cases there is no money left to confiscate because of the lavish lifestyle of the traffickers. Gambling, drugs, renting expensive cars, sometimes boats or whole restaurants are common in this milieu (GE-E4). Western Union and MoneyGram represent the most common financial services where money transfer can reliably be traced (GE-E4). Once there is a suspect to whom the money flows can be attributed, the transferred

sums need to be plausibly related to the broader criminal pattern that emerge from the profit estimation (GE-E4). For this estimation, usually the locality where prostitution takes place is under surveillance, technically or by police personnel, in order to have an idea about the number of clients and the daily profits (GE-E4). This can be done once the major investigation has been initiated. This estimation is the fundament for the final confiscation sum as determined by the judge.

Applying these techniques only makes sense when there is high probability of a successful investigation. THB is difficult to prove, especially as it relies on the major witness – the victim – whose testimony is often too contradictory or is retracted at a later stage. In the case of Bulgaria, for example, there haven't been follow-up cases, after the first cooperation in that format.

The suspects' accounts can also be seized in foreign countries – theoretically worldwide, but in practice it depends on the cooperation with the respective country and official letters (GE-E5). When good relations already exist, actions can be quickly taken, for example by freezing accounts, while the formal decision is handed in later. With the decision there are several ratified agreements between EU countries based on reciprocity, but it always depends on the country. The cooperation with Turkey, for example, has become quite difficult during the last years.

The amount of confiscated assets increased significantly in the last years. In all of Germany in 2016, in 16 investigative cases around €2.5 million were confiscated provisionally. This sum was significantly higher than for the year before (2015: €512,000) (Bundeskriminalamt, 2017).

International cooperation means that a German prosecutor gets in touch with the foreign prosecutor in order to get some information, and this often takes place too slowly. This is often a difficult procedure at the police level, as different EU countries follow different legal regulations how to handle these kinds of requests. In very urgent cases, one can directly get in touch with other police entities and then hand in the official request up to two weeks later. First, all the documents need to be translated, then the German legislative text needs to be included, adding up to quite a lot of time and effort to invest.

Rogatory letters function the same way. With some countries the exchange is well established and information about bank accounts and their owners are easy and quick to obtain. The account owner can be investigated via an automatic system, but the bank balance is only to be inquired via a request for information sent directly to the bank.

Of course this is more difficult to be obtained abroad, the bank has first to be contacted and will need some time to respond. This procedure usually takes more than 48 hours (GE-E5). This often might be too slow, as the money can easily be transferred quickly further into other accounts. The advantage of online banking is that it makes it very easy to quickly transfer from one account to another (GE-E4).

Of course there is a protocol, but it doesn't help to know that the money went from Germany to Italy and then further to Belarus; in these cases investigators are always too late to seize the assets (GE-E4). In the context of THB this has not been a very relevant issue yet. The traffickers often transfer directly to their own accounts, be it in Bulgaria or Thailand.

## 5. CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The fight against human trafficking will be of special relevance during the next EU policy cycle (2018 – 2021) for the fight against criminality. Europe-wide networks of traffickers, pimps and money launderers are operating at a highly organised level. As to some extent they can be attributed to organised crime, a cooperation of different authorities in the countries of origin as well as in transit and target countries is of vital importance for an efficient prosecution.

Core elements are international cooperation and an early inclusion of the financial investigations into the broader investigation, also transnationally. The legal framework is sufficient, it only has to be implemented, the same counts for technological means. The fact that money is transferred in cash in THB cases and its tracks are often blurred makes it difficult to identify who is profiting beyond the given names. If there are data available it can be tracked, but in order to follow cash transfers one would have to launch an inspection and of course not every cash transfer is being observable, as we would need an army of investigators. The success in uncovering THB structures usually is a variable directly dependent on the police efforts in this field.

The 2017 Protection of Prostitution Act includes extensive regulations, and the core element is the obligation to obtain a permission to practice the profession of a sex worker. Prostitution is becoming linked to some minimum requirements related to the reliability of the business operator. That way prostitution remains a legal activity, but sex workers need to register in order to be allowed to pursue their business. The existing gaps in the regulations made it difficult to fight against that kind of criminality, but now many experts hope that the regulation of prostitution will contribute to a reduction of opportunities for exploitation in the red-light milieu.

In order to be able to conduct more successful investigations, it is also very important to strengthen the NGOs working with victims. Victims need to be given the security that someone cares for their safety and helps them to get into a stable psychological condition. This is important for the investigation as it contributes to valuable testimonies. Without these no trials would be possible (GE-E5).

THB is a crime that needs to remain in the focus of police investigations. Police has to be present and the women have to know whom to

approach in case of forced prostitution. The initiative of establishing contact should be taken by the local authorities. Often, the same victims who initially claim that they are working as free prostitutes, in later interrogations tell about the exploitative structures behind the scenes.

## LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

|                  |   |
|------------------|---|
| <b>Mol</b>       | Ministry of Interior  |
| <b>BKA</b>       | Bundeskriminalamt   |
| <b>BBmeZ</b>     | Beratungsstelle für Betroffene von Menschenhandel<br>und Zwangsprostitution |
| <b>ProstSchG</b> | Prostituiertenschutzgesetz  |
| <b>KriPo</b>     | Kriminalpolizei   |
| <b>OK</b>        | Organisierte Kriminalität   |
| <b>StA</b>       | Staatsanwaltschaft  |
| <b>StGB</b>      | Strafgesetzbuch   |
| <b>StPO</b>      | Strafprozessordnung   |

## LIST OF INTERVIEWEES

| <b>Respondent code</b> | <b>Position/Department</b>                | <b>Institution/Role</b>  |
|------------------------|---|--|
| GE-E1                  | Police Officer, Countering THB department | Investigator   |
| GE-E2                  | Police Officer, Countering THB department | Investigator   |
| GE-E3                  | Police Officer, Countering THB department | Financial Investigator   |
| GE-E4                  | Police Officer, Countering THB department | Financial Investigator   |
| GE-E5                  | Regional Court                            | Prosecutor   |
| GE-E6                  | Regional Court                            | Prosecutor   |
| GE-E7                  | NGO                                       | BBMeZ – counselling for victims of trafficking in human beings and forced prostitution |
| GE-E8                  | NGO                                       | BBMeZ Mitarbeiterin  |
| GE-E9                  | Political party                           | Expert   |



## REFERENCES

- Aghatise, E. (2004). Trafficking for Prostitution in Italy. Possible Effects of Government Proposals for Legalization of Brothels. *Violence against Women*, 10 10, pp. 1126-1155.
- Behnke, J., Baur, N. & Behnke, N. (2006). *Empirische Methoden der Politikwissenschaft*. Paderborn: Verlag Ferdinand Schöningh.
- Boatca, M. (2003). *Zum (umstrittenen) Begriff des "Opfers" von Menschenhandel. Vortrag im Rahmen der Tagung "Frauenmigration"*. Magdeburg: Manuskript.
- Bortz, J. & Döring, N. (2005). *Forschungsmethoden und Evaluation*. Heidelberg: Springer.
- Bundeskriminalamt (2016). *Menschenhandel. Bundeslagebild 2015*, Wiesbaden: BKA.
- Bundeskriminalamt (2017). *Menschenhandel. Bundeslagebild 2016*, Wiesbaden: BKA.
- Cho, S.-Y., Dreher, A. & Neumayer, E. (2013). Does Legalized Prostitution Increase Human Trafficking? *World Development*, 41C, pp. 67-82.
- Europol (2016). *Situation Report – Trafficking in human beings in the EU*, The Hague: Europol.
- Flick, U. (1995). Stationen des qualitativen Forschungsprozesses. In: U. Flick, et al. Hrsg. *Handbuch qualitative Sozialforschung. Grundlagen, Konzepte, Methoden und Anwendungen*. Weinheim: Beltz, pp. 147-173.
- Galiana, C. (2000). *Trafficking In Women*, The European Parliament, Directorate General for Research, Brussels.
- Gerheim, U. (2012). *Die Produktion des Freiers – Macht im Feld der Prostitution. Eine soziologische Studie*. transcript Genderstudies Hrsg. Bielefeld: transcript Verlag.
- Gerheim, U., 3.12. (2013). Debatte Prostitution Der Freier, das unbekanntes Wesen. *taz.de*.
- Girtler, R. (2004). *Der Strich. Soziologie eines Milieus*. Wien: LIT.
- Glaser, B. G. & Strauss, A. L. (1998). *Grounded Theory. Strategien qualitativer Forschung*. Orig. 1967: The discovery of grounded theory. Strategies for qualitative research. Chicago: Aldine Hrsg. Bern: Huber.
- Goffman, E. (1974). *Frame Analysis: An Essay on the Organization of Experience*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.
- Herz, A. L. (2005). *Menschenhandel. Eine empirische Untersuchung zur Strafverfolgungspraxis*. s.l.:s.n.
- Hofmann, J. (2002). *Menschenhandel – Beziehungen zur Organisierten Kriminalität und Versuche der strafrechtlichen Bekämpfung*. Frankfurt am Main: Europäischer Verlag der Wissenschaften.
- Knoche, M. (2009). Menschenhandel und Zwangsprostitution" – ein Gespräch mit Petra Wulf-Lengner. *Junge Welt*, 6. Oktober.
- Koelges, B. (2003). Formen der Gewalt. Menschenhandel. In: S. e.V., Hrsg. *Grenzüberschreitendes Verbrechen – Grenzüberschreitende Zusammenarbeit*. Boppard: Solvodi e.V.
- Lamnek, S. (2003). Sex and Crime: Prostitution und Menschenhandel. In: S. Lamnek & M. Boatca, Hrsg. *Geschlecht – Gewalt – Gesellschaft*. Opladen: Leske + Budrich, pp. 475-497.
- Lamnek, S. (2005). *Qualitative Sozialforschung. Bd. 1. Methodologie*. Weinheim: Beltz.

- Mayring, P. (2003). *Qualitative Inhaltsanalyse: Grundlagen und Techniken*. Weinheim und Basel: Beltz Verlag.
- Ottermann, R. (2003). Geschlechterdividenden in Gewaltdiskursen. In: S. Lamnek & M. Boatca, Hrsg. *Geschlecht – Gewalt – Gesellschaft*. Opladen: Leske + Budrich, pp. 163-178.
- Ringel, D. (2003). *Ekel in der Pflege. Eine "gewaltige" Emotion*. Frankfurt/M.: Mabuse.
- Schmackpfeffer, P. (1999). *Frauenbewegung und Prostitution: über das Verhältnis der alten und neuen deutschen Frauenbewegung zur Prostitution*. s.l.:BIS Verlag.
- Schmitter, R. (2013). Prostitution – Das älteste Gewerbe der Welt?. *Aus Politik und Zeitgeschichte*, 9, p. 23f.
- Schuster, M. (2002). Prostitution professionell. Über die Sozialtechniken von Sexarbeiterinnen. *Parapluie [elektronische Zeitschrift für Kulturen, Künste, Literaturen]*12.
- Stallberg, F. W. (1999). Prostitution. In: G. Günter Albrecht, A. Groenemeyer & F. W. Stallberg, Hrsg. *Handbuch soziale Probleme*. Opladen: Westdeutscher Verlag, pp. 590-60.